TRINITY A description of the God of Christian Scripture, revealed and understood as Father, Son, and Holy Spirit; a fundamental doctrine of Christian theology.

Introduction

The word *Trinity* does not appear in the Bible. However, the doctrine is based on several emphatic assertions that are found throughout the biblical writings:

- 1. There is only one God (Deut 6:4; Isa 43:10; 46:9; Rom 3:30; 1 Cor 8:4; Jas 2:19).
- 2. The one whom Jesus called "Father" (John 6:27; 1 Cor 8:6), the incarnate Son (Matt 1:23; John 1:1; Rom 9:5; Col 2:9; Titus 2:13–14; Heb 1:1–3), and the Holy Spirit (Acts 5:3–4; 28:25–27; 2 Cor 3:7–18) all possess the necessary attributes of this God.
- 3. These three are not identical; they interact with one another and their identities are constituted with respect to one another (Matt 3:16–17; 12:32; 17:5; Luke 3:21–22; 4:1; John 15:26; 16:7–16; 2 Cor 13:14). They act distinctly but in concert with one another (Gen 1:1–3; John 1:1–3; 2 Cor 4:6; Col 1:15–17; Heb 1:2–3).

The doctrine of the <u>Trinity</u> was increasingly systematized in the post-New Testament era, as certain teachings that were not consistent with the apostolic faith

increased in popularity. From AD 325–787, seven ecumenical councils were called to deliberate aspects of at least one member of the Trinity. Although most discussion focused on the person of Christ (e.g., the relationship between His humanity and divinity), it inherently involved the Church's attempt to understand God's revelation of His Triune self.

The Trinity in the Old Testament

The doctrine of the <u>Trinity</u> relies mostly on the New Testament , but certain groundwork is implicitly present in the Old Testament. This does not reflect a change in the Godhead, but rather a change in how God chose to reveal Himself before the "fullness of time" (Gal 4:4) and how pre-Christian worshipers observed God's activity in the world.

God as Father in the Old Testament

The personal designation of God as "Father" seems to be more developed in the later literature of the deuterocanonical Old Testament (e.g., Tob 13:4; Sir 23:1; 51:10; Wis 14:3). Even so, these depictions of God as Father relate primarily to God's relationship with His followers, and not the pre-incarnate Word. Designations of God as Father in the earlier Old Testament canon make this clear, as the texts frequently depict Israel as God's adopted child (Exod 4:22–23; Deut 32:6, 18–19).

During the time of the monarchy, the relationship between God and the king

was initially described in filial language: "I will be a father to him, and he shall be a son to me" (2 Sam 7:14). The Psalms echo this language. For example, Psalm 2:7 states, "You are my son; today I have begotten you" (see also Pss 68; 89); the Church would later take this particular psalm as evidence of the pre-existence of the Word (e.g., Acts 13:33; Heb 1:5; 5:5). Although the Prophets favored marital metaphors when describing the relationship between God and His people, paternal metaphors are present (e.g., Jer 31:9; Isa 1:2; 30:1; 40:3-4; 42:16; 43:19-20; Hos 11:1-4).

The Son in the Old Testament

The Son, Jesus, does not appear as such in the Old Testament; neither is there any precise, explicit analogue for the incarnate Son in the Old Testament. However, there are two divine personifications—the Word and Wisdom—that allowed New Testament writers and the church fathers to make connections between the incarnate Son and the hidden Trinity of the Old Testament.

Both of these personifications are connected to the work of God's Spirit.

1. The Word is instrumental in creative activity, emanating as a speech-act from the mouth of <u>God</u> (Gen 1:1–2:4; Psa 33:8–9; Sirach 43:26; Judith 16:14; Wisdom 9:1–2). Deuterocanonical literature also depicts the Word as a warrior instrumental in the exodus

(Wisdom 18:15–16).

2. Wisdom often embodies creative and even salvific attributes of God; usually depicted through feminine language. Wisdom is located with God and is fully accessible only to God (Job 28; Prov 2–4; 8–9). The deuterocanonical work of Sirach (especially Sirach 1:1–30; 24:1–34; 51:1–27) and the Book of Wisdom of Solomon (especially Wisdom 7, 9–10) offer much more developed personifications of Wisdom.

The Spirit in the Old Testament
The Spirit is mentioned frequently in the Old Testament to describe the activity of God in the world. Though the Hebrew (Π1Π, rwch) and Greek (πνεύμα, pneuma) may be rendered as "wind" or "breath," both still reference their originator, God. Activities of God's Spirit in the Old Testament include the following:

- The Spirit hovered over the surface of the waters of creation (Gen 1:2).
- The Spirit empowered leaders, judges, and prophets (e.g., Num 11:16–17, 24–25; Judg 3:10; 6:34; 1 Sam 10:6, 10; Ezek 2:1–3).
- The Spirit rested within the nation of Israel (Isa 63:11–13; Hag 2:5).
- The Sprit will empower Israel's Messiah (Isa 11:2; 42:1; 61:1–2).

The Spirit is very much personally from God and described by His activity; the Old

<u>Testament</u> does not probe the depths of the Spirit's origination or essential unity with the one God of Israel.

Although the Word, Wisdom, and the Spirit are not considered unique gods separate from the one God in the Old Testament (and thus deserving of their own worship), neither are they treated as mere modes of God's existence. This would allow for the earliest Jewish Christians to accept more readily Jesus' teachings concerning His relation to the Father and the Spirit. The first commandment (to have no other gods before Yahweh) and the Shema (Deut 6:4) could still be confessed along with the Trinitarian reality of Father, Son, and Holy Spirit.

Trinity in the New Testament

The New Testament focuses on the person and work of Jesus Christ; the entire corpus confesses and demonstrates that Jesus is the Son of God. The nature and role of the Spirit continues to be more implicit than explicit, with the exception of His outpouring at Pentecost. But the revelation of God in the New Testament is generally couched in Trinitarian language.

Trinity in the Gospels

From the beginning of the Gospel accounts, the writers' focus is to link Jesus with God through His miraculous birth. In Luke's account, the angel proclaims to Mary, "The Holy Spirit will come upon you, and the power of the Most High will

overshadow you; therefore the child to be born will be holy; he will be called Son of God" (Luke 1:35). Having no earthly father, Jesus can openly confess His intimate relation with the heavenly Father; Jesus receives directions and knowledge from God (John 5:19; 14:12), and He prays to God by addressing Him as Father (John 17:1; see also Mark 14:36; Matt 16:17; Luke 22:29).

The Trinitarian nature of God as revealed in the Gospel accounts is especially clear in two major events:

- 1. Jesus' baptism. In the Synoptic Gospels Jesus allows John the Baptist to baptize Him; the Father speaks clearly, announcing Jesus' identity: "You are my Son, the Beloved; with you I am well pleased" (Mark 1:11). The Spirit then descends upon Jesus "like a dove" (Mark 1:10), empowering Him for His mission and (according to Mark) driving Him into the wilderness to undergo temptation (Mark 1:12). Jesus ministered afterward according to the power of the Spirit (Matt 12:18, 28; Luke 11:20).
- 2. The Transfiguration of Jesus . The Synoptic Gospels (and also 2 Pet 1:16–18) describe a miraculous revelation to three of Jesus' disciples: Peter, James the son of Zebedee, and John (Matt 17:1–9; Mark 9:2–8; Luke 9:28–36). Elijah and Moses appear and converse with Jesus, and Jesus is not only transfigured in glorious bril-

liance before the disciples, but a voice declares from heaven, "This is my Son, my Chosen; listen to him" (Luke 9:35). The disciples do not fully understand the event, but Christians reading the accounts would perceive that Jesus is again directly and powerfully linked to God the Father.

In addition to these explicit revelations of the Triune God, Jesus' command in Matt 28:19 to baptize "in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit" has had lasting theological and liturgical impact in the Church. Although there are no further references to baptism being performed in the name of the Trinity in the New Testament, this formulation becomes rooted in the consciousness of the Church.

Trinity in Acts and The Letters

The period between the ascension of Jesus and the formation of the early church was characterized by rapid growth through the work of the Holy Spirit. Jesus instructed His disciples to wait for the outpouring of the Spirit, who would empower the Church to fulfill His mission. Both the Father and the Son are instrumental in this outpouring at Pentecost insofar as the Father sends the Spirit at the behest of the Son (Acts 2:32–33).

Later, Peter uses Trinitarian language to express the outworking of salvation among the persecuted Church: "The God of our ancestors raised up Jesus, whom you had killed by hanging him on a tree. God exalted him at his right hand as Leader and Savior that he might give repentance to Israel and <u>forgiveness</u> of sins. And we are witnesses to these things, and so is the <u>Holy Spirit</u> whom God has given to those who obey him" (Acts 5:30–32). This theme is present throughout the <u>New Testament</u> corpus, appearing frequently in the Pauline Letters. For instance:

- In 1 Corinthians the distribution of various spiritual gifts is explained with reference to "the same Spirit," "the same Lord" (Jesus), and "the same God" (the Father) who are all present in the Church—three in one (1 Cor 12:4–6).
- The benediction of 2 Corinthians is tripartite: "The grace of the Lord Jesus Christ, the love of God, and the communion of the Holy Spirit be with all of you" (2 Cor 13:14).
- Ephesians includes four Triune formulations:
 - a. "So he [Jesus] came and proclaimed peace to you who were far off and peace to those who were near; for through him both of us have access in one Spirit to the Father" (Eph 2:17–18).
 - b. "For this reason I bow my knees before the Father ... I pray that ... he may grant that you may be strengthened in your inner being with power through his Spirit, and

- that Christ may dwell in your hearts through faith" (Eph 3:14–17).
- c. "There is one body and one Spirit, just as you were called to the one hope of your calling, one Lord, one faith, one baptism, one God and Father of all, who is above all and through all and in all" (Eph 4:4–6).
- d. "Be filled with the Spirit ... singing and making melody to the Lord in your hearts, giving thanks to God the Father at all times and for everything in the name of our Lord Jesus Christ" (Eph 5:18–20).

These identifications of the persons and work of the Trinity are not separate theological musings, but are connected directly with the life of Christians. First Peter further exemplifies this, beginning by intentionally locating its readers within the realm of salvation-history: They "have been chosen and destined by God the Father and sanctified by the Spirit to be obedient to Jesus Christ and to be sprinkled with his blood" (1 Pet 1:2). The Church cannot separate itself from the Triune God, who has acted to save it.

Despite the lack of formal theological exposition of the nature of the Triune God, it is clear that by the close of the New Testament era, God was understood to be Triune. Centuries of further exposition would seek to clarify God's Triune nature.

Exposition of the <u>Trinity</u> in the Early Church

In the following centuries, the Trinitarian doctrine was expressed predominantly through worship. Yet persecution and internal discrepancies in teaching soon forced Christians to think more systematically about God. Early Christian documents offer insights into how early Christians understood the Trinity.

- The *Didache* recommends that baptism be performed only "in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit" (*Didache* 7:1, 3; Holmes, *Apostolic Fathers*, 355).
- Clement of Rome continues the tradition of the New Testament writers by distinguishing the roles of the members of the Trinity without clarifying how the roles are connected with their essence: "The majestic scepter of God, our Lord Christ Jesus, did not come with the pomp of arrogance or pride (though he could have done so), but in humility, just as the Holy Spirit spoke concerning him" (1 Clement 16:1–2; Holmes, *Apostolic Fathers*, 65).
- Justin Martyr, writing primarily on the meaning of Jesus as the Word and in defense of Christian theology, expresses the Trinitarian nature of God with reference to the worship of the Church and the activities of God in creation, salvation, and prophecy, often echoing what may have been early credo statements (Justin Martyr,

First Apology, 6; 13; 61).

- Irenaeus of Lyons, writing to counter the teachings of Marcion and Valentinus, relies upon the traditions handed down through baptismal practices and Scripture to demonstrate that Jesus is the Son of the Father (Irenaeus, Against Heresies). Irenaeus reminds his readers that no one can fully comprehend the Trinity and that there is a limit to what can and cannot be said about Him (Irenaeus, Adversus Haereses 2.28.6).
- Tertullian, writing in response to Marcion and modalist monarchians (who saw the Son and the Spirit as alternate "modes" of existence of the one Father, and not as distinct persons), was the first to categorize God as Trinity systematically and to hypothesize God's existence as three persons (tres personae) of one substance (una substantia; Tertullian, Adversus Praxean).
- The Alexandrian Origen, attempting to correct those who claimed that Jesus was merely a man "adopted" by the Holy Spirit at His baptism, formulated the doctrine of the eternal generation of the Son through exegesis of John's Gospel. He also sought to correct Valentinian Gnostics who held that in the eternal generation of the Son, the Father's divine essence was split (Origen, De Principiis).

Although some confusion would exist between the Latin West and the Greek East over vocabulary ("essence" versus "substance," for example), the Church was beginning to use philosophical logic to interpret Scripture and develop a theology of the Trinity that would account for three distinct persons somehow all being divine (and especially account for a man who was both fully God and fully man).

Ecumenical Councils

Origen's language and influence would cause several problems for the Church, as the Alexandrian Arius (ca. AD 250–336) further systematized Origen's theology. Arius upheld Origen's teaching that the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit were three distinct subsistent realities, but he subordinated each person, claiming that although the Son shared in the Father's divinity (and likewise the Spirit), the Son and Spirit should be considered as created things. Athanasius of Alexandria attempted to eradicate this heresy from the Church (Athanasius, Contra Arianos).

Participants in the First Council of Nicaea in AD 325 developed a creed that reflected the orthodox views of the Church regarding the revelation of God the Trinity as ὁμοούσιος (homoousios, "of one substance").

The First Council of Constantinople in PAD 381 would later expand the creed to its most lasting form, which is still

used in worship today. The three main articles of the creed assert belief in one God, who is the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit, and describe how these three persons are related. Even this creed would not prove universal for the Church, however, as East and West eventually divided partly over the issue of the Spirit's procession: The West held that the Spirit proceeds from the Father and the Son (filioque), a statement that was added to the creed at the anti-Arian Council of Toledo in 589 but was not present in the original Greek text.

Even in the first major exposition of the divinity of the Holy Spirit-Athanasius' Letters to Serapion—the seminal theologian was not willing to proceed that far; however, the teaching did exist outside of this particular council. Hilary of Poitiers, for example, writing in the mid-fourth century, speaks to the Spirit's origination from both the Father and the Son, or coming from the Father through the Son (Hilary, *De Trinitate* 12.56). Hilary was one of the first to write explicitly on the Trinity for its own sake, and he especially attempted to explain differences and similarities between Western and Eastern formulations of the Trinity.

Additional Writings

Two other early major corpi emerge from the Trinitarian controversies of ► the fourth century:

1. The writings of the Cappadocians

- —Basil of Caesarea (►330–379), Gregory of Nyssa (►ca. 332–395), and Gregory of Nazianzus (►ca. 329–389);
- 2. De Trinitate by Augustine of Hippo (\triangleright 354–430).

The Cappadocians. The Cappadocians made major contributions to the formulations of the creed finalized at Constantinople in PAD 381. They were concerned primarily with the interaction between Christian theology and Greek philosophy for the sake of stamping out all forms of Arianism and Eunomianism. This led to reflection on how humanity could understand the united yet differentiated nature of the Trinity, best explained as one substance (οὐσία, ousia) in three persons (ὑποστάσεις, hypostaseis).

All three Cappadocians affirm that the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit are of the same substance (ὁμοούσιος, homoousios). For example, Basil, like Athanasius, argues for the full divinity of the Holy Spirit in *De Spiritu Sancto* by appealing to the activity of the Spirit and the subsequent logical implications of His origination from the Godhead. Basil also reflects on the origination of the set ordering of "Father, Son, and Holy Spirit" by pointing to its usage in the New Testament.

Augustine's *De Trinitate*. Whereas the Cappadocians wrote primarily in a polemical context, <u>Augustine</u> wrote *De Trinitate* over an extended period of reflection. Augustine focuses particularly on how

humanity is able to perceive and understand the <u>Trinity</u>, developing a series of analogies that rely on Scripture and philosophy.

In Book 8, <u>Augustine</u> develops a model of the Trinity based on love:

- the Father is the Lover:
- the Son is the Beloved; and
- the <u>Holy Spirit</u> is the mutual love they share.

The limitation of this model is the possibility of depersonalizing and reducing the Spirit. This model buttressed earlier Western assertions of the double procession of the Spirit.

In Book 9, <u>Augustine</u> explores a second analogy based on intrapersonal psychology (the mind existing, knowing itself, and loving itself):

- the Father as Being or Presence;
- the Son as <u>Conscience</u> or Self-Knowledge; and
- the Holy Spirit as Self-Love.

Augustine later refined his analogy of love (Augustine, *De Trinitate* 15).

Augustine readily admits that humanity must ultimately regard any exploration of the <u>Trinity</u> as being handicapped by insufficient language and, when necessary, be content to rest in what has been revealed of divine mystery (Augustine, *De Trinitate 5*).

Bibliography

Anatolios, Khaled. Athanasius: The

Coherence of His Thought. London: Routledge, 1998.

Athanasius. Contra Arianos.

———. Letters to Serapion.

Augustine of Hippo. *De Trinitate*.

Ayres, Lewis. Nicaea and Its Legacy: An
Approach to Fourth Century Trinitarian
Theology. Oxford: Oxford University
Press, 2006.

- ——. "Not Three People: The Fundamental Themes of Gregory of Nyssa's Trinitarian Theology as Seen in To Ablabius: On Not Three Gods."
 Modern Theology 18.4 (2002): 445–74.
- ——. "'Remember That You Are Catholic' (Serm. 52.2): Augustine on the Unity of the Triune God." *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 8.1 (2000): 39–82.
- Bacon, Hannah. What's Right with the Trinity?: Conversations in Feminist Theology. Ashgate New Critical Thinking in Religion, Theology and Biblical Studies. Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate, 2009.
- Barnes, Michel René, and Daniel H. Williams, eds. *Arianism After Arius: Essays on the Development of the Fourth-Century Trinitarian Conflicts*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1993.
- ——. "Augustine in Contemporary Trinitarian Theology." *Biblical Studies* 56 (1995): 237–50.
- Barth, Karl. *Church Dogmatics II.*1: The *Doctrine of God*. Translated by T. H. L. Parker, W. B. Johnston, Harold

- Knight, and J.L.M. Haire. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1957.
- Basil of Caesarea, De Spiritu Sancto.
- Beckwith, Carl L. Hilary of Poitiers on the Trinity: From De Fide to De Trinitate.
 Oxford Early Christian Studies.
 Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Beeley, Christopher A. Gregory of Nazianzus on the Trinity and the Knowledge of God: In Your Light We Shall See Light. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Behr, John. *The Nicene Faith*, *Part* 1: *True God of True God*. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2004.
- ——. The Nicene Faith, Part 2: One of the Holy Trinity. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2004.
- ———. "The Paschal Foundation of Christian Theology." St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly 45.2 (2001): 115–36.
- The Way to Nicaea. Crestwood,N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press,2001.
- Benner, Drayton C. "Augustine and Karl Rahner on the Relationship between the Immanent and the Economic Trinity." *International Journal of Systematic Theology* 9.1 (2007): 24–38.
- Block, Daniel I. "How Many is God? An Investigation into the Meaning of Deuteronomy 6:4–5." *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 47.2 (2004): 193–212.
- Bobrinskoy, Boris. The Mystery of the Trin-

- ity: Trinitarian Experience and Vision in the Biblical and Patristic Tradition. Translated by Anthony P. Gythiel. Crestwood, NY: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1999.
- Bracken, Joseph A. "Trinity: Economic and Immanent." *Horizons* 25 (1998): 7–22.
- Bradshaw, David. "The Concept of the Divine Energies." *Philosophy & Theology* 18.1 (2006): 93–120.
- Bray, Gerald L. *The Doctrine of God*.

 Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity
 Press, 1993.
- Buckley, James J., and David S. Yeago, eds. Knowing the Triune God: The Work of the Spirit in the Practices of the Church. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 2001.
- Childs, Brevard. Biblical Theology of the Old and New Testaments: Theological Reflection on the Christian Bible. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992.
- Coffey, David. *Deus Trinitas: The Doctrine of the Triune God*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Collins, Paul M. Trinitarian Theology West and East: Karl Barth, the Cappadocian Fathers, and John Zizioulas. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- Colyer, Elmer M. The Promise of
 Trinitarian Theology: Theologians in
 Dialogue with T. F. Torrance. Lanham,
 Md.: Rowman & Littlefield, 2002.
- Cunningham, David S. These Three Are
 One: The Practice of Trinitarian
 Theology. Malden, Mass.: Blackwell,

- 1998.
- Davis, Leo Donald. The First Seven Ecumenical Councils (325–787): Their History and Theology. Theology and Life Series 21. Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical, 1983.
- Davis, Stephen T., et al., eds. The Incarnation: An Interdisciplinary Symposium on the Incarnation of the Son of God. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Davis, Stephen T., Daniel Kendall, and Gerald O'Collins, eds. *The Trinity: An Interdisciplinary Symposium on the Trinity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Dünzl, Franz. A Brief History of the Doctrine of the Trinity in the Early Church. Translated by John Bowden. New York: T&T Clark, 2007.
- Fortman, Edmund J. The Triune God: A
 Historical Study of the Doctrine of the
 Trinity. Eugene, Oreg.: Wipf & Stock,
 1999.
- Fulford, Ben. "'One Commixture of Light': Rethinking some Modern Uses and Critiques of Gregory of Nazianzus on the Unity and Equality of the Divine Persons." *International Journal of Systematic Theology* 11.2 (2009): 172–89.
- George, Timothy, ed. *God the Holy Trinity: Reflections on Christian Faith and Practice*. Grand Rapids, Mich.:

 Baker Academic, 2006.
- Gregory of Nazianzus. *Orationes*. Gregory of Nyssa. *Ad Simplicium de Fide*.

- Grenz, Stanley J. Rediscovering the Triune God: The Trinity in Contemporary Theology. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2004.
- Gruenler, Royce G. The Trinity in the Gospel of John: A Thematic Commentary on the Fourth Gospel.

 Eugene, Oreg.: Wipf & Stock, 2004.
- Gunton, Colin E. Enlightenment and
 Alienation: An Essay Towards a
 Trinitarian Theology. Eugene, Oreg.:
 Wipf & Stock, 2006.
- ——. Father, Son and Spirit: Toward a Fully Trinitarian Theology. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 2003.
- ———. "The God of Jesus Christ." *Theology Today* 54.3 (1997): 325–34.
- ——. The Promise of Trinitarian Theology. 2nd ed. London: T&T Clark, 2003.
- ———. The Triune Creator: A Historical & Systematic Study. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1998.
- Gunton, Colin E., ed. *Trinity, Time, and Church: A Response to the Theology of Robert W. Jenson*. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 2000.
- Hanson, R. P. C. The Search for the Christian Doctrine of God: The Arian Controversy, 318–381. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Baker Academic, 2006.
- Harrison, Verna. "Perichoresis in the Greek Fathers." St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly 35.1 (1991): 53– 65.
- Hart, David Bentley. The Beauty of the Infinite: The Aesthetics of Christian

- *Truth.* Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 2004.
- Helmer, Christine. "God from Eternity to Eternity: Luther's Trinitarian Understanding." *Harvard Theological* Review 96.2 (2003): 127–46.
- Hengel, Martin, and C. K. Barrett. *Conflicts and Challenges in Early Christianity*. Edited by Donald A. Hagner. Harrisburg, Pa.: Trinity, 1999.
- Hilary of Poitiers. De Trinitate.
- Hildebrand, Stephen M. The Trinitarian Theology of Basil of Caesarea: A Synthesis of Greek Thought and Biblical Truth. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 2007.
- Holmes, Michael W. *The Apostolic*Fathers: Greek Texts and English

 Translations. 3rd ed. Grand Rapids,
 Mich.: Baker Academic, 2007.
- Holsteen, Nathan D. "The Trinity in the Book of Hebrews." *Bibliotheca Sacra* 168 (July-Sept. 2011): 334–46.
- Hurtado, Larry W. At the Origins of Christian Worship: The Context and Character of Earliest Christian Devotion.
 Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 2000.
- Irenaeus of Lyons. Adversus Haereses.
- Jacobs, Nathan. "On 'Not Three Gods'—Again: Can a Primary-Secondary Substance Reading of Ousia and Hypostasis Avoid Tritheism?" *Modern Theology* 24.3 (2008): 331–58.
- Jenson, Robert W. "The Bible and the Trinity." *Pro Ecclesia* 11.3 (2002): 329-

- 39.
- ———. "The Hidden and Triune God."

 International Journal of Systematic
 Theology 2.1 (2000): 5–12.
- ——. Systematic Theology, Volume 1: The *Triune God*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- ——. The Triune Identity: God According to the Gospel. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1982.
- Johnson, John F. "Speaking of the Triune God: Augustine, Aquinas, and the Language of Analogy." *Concordia Theological Quarterly* 67.3–4 (2003): 215–27.
- Jowers, Dennis W. "Divine Unity and the Economy of Salvation in the De Trinitate of Augustine." *Reformed Theological Review* 60.2 (2001): 68–84.
- Juel, Donald H. "The Trinity and the New Testament." *Theology Today* 54.3 (1997): 312–24.
- Jüngel, Eberhard. God's Being is in Becoming: The Trinitarian Being of God in the Theology of Karl Barth. Translated by John Webster. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 2001.
- Justin Martyr. First Apology.
- Kärkkäinen, Veli-Matti. *The Trinity: Global Perspectives*. Louisville, KY.:
 Westminster John Knox, 2007.
- Kasper, Walter. *The God of Jesus Christ*. Translated by Matthew J. O'Connell. New York: Crossroad, 1984.
- Keener, Craig S. "Is Subordination Within the Trinity Really Heresy? A Study of

- John 5:18 in Context." *Trinity Journal* 20.1 (1999): 39–51.
- Kelly, Charles J. "Classical Theism and the Doctrine of the Trinity." *Religious Studies* 30.1 (1994): 67–88.
- Kelly, J. N. D. *Early Christian Creeds*. 3rd ed. London: Longman, 1972; Repr., 1989.
- ——. *Early Christian Doctrines*. 5th rev. ed. Peabody, Mass.: Prince, 2004.
- Köstenberger, Andreas J., and Scott R. Swain. *Father, Son, and Spirit: The Trinity and John's Gospel*. New Studies in Biblical Theology 24. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity, 2008.
- Knuuttila, Simo, and Risto Saarinen.

 "Luther's Trinitarian Theology and its
 Medieval Background." Studia
 Theologica 53.1 (1999): 3–12.
- Kuehn, Evan F. "The Johannine Logic of Augustine's Trinity: A Dogmatic Sketch." *Theological Studies* 68.3 (2007): 572–94.
- LaCugna, Catherine Mowry. *God for Us: The Trinity and Christian Life*. New
 York: HarperSanFrancisco, 1991.
- Louth, Andrew. "Love and the Trinity: Saint Augustine and the Greek Fathers." Augustinian Studies 33/1 (2002): 1–16.
- McCall, Thomas H. Which Trinity? Whose Monotheism? Philosophical and Systematic Theologians on the Metaphysics of Trinitarian Theology. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 2010.
- Metzger, Paul Louis, ed. Trinitarian

- Soundings in Systematic Theology. London: T&T Clark, 2005.
- Molnar, Paul D. *Thomas F. Torrance: Theologian of the Trinity*. Great

 Theologians. Burlington, Vt: Ashgate,
 2009.
- Moltmann, Jürgen. *History and the Triune God*. New York: Crossroad, 1992.
- ——. The Trinity and the Kingdom: The Doctrine of God. Translated by Margaret Kohl. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1993.
- Newbigin, Leslie. *Trinitarian Doctrine for Today's Mission*. Eugene, Oreg.: Wipf & Stock. 2006.
- O'Collins, Gerald. The Tripersonal God: Understanding and Interpreting the Trinity. Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist, 1999.
- O'Donnell, John J. *The Mystery of the Triune God*. New York: Paulist, 1989.
- ———. *Trinity and Temporality*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1983.
- Origen, De Principiis.
- Pelikan, Jarislov. *The Christian Tradition*, *Vol.* 1: *The Emergence of Catholic Tradition* (100–600). Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1971.
- Placher, William C. *The Triune God: An Essay in Postliberal Theology*.
 Louisville, KY.: Westminster John Knox, 2007.
- Rahner, Karl. *The Trinity*. Translated by Joseph Donceel. New York: Crossroad, 1997.
- Ratzinger, Joseph. The God of Jesus Christ: Meditations on the Triune God. San

- Francisco: Ignatius Press, 2008.
- Reid, Duncan. Energies of the Spirit:

 Trinitarian Models in Eastern Orthodox
 and Western Theology. Atlanta:
 Scholars, 1997.
- Rowe, C. Kavin. "Luke and the Trinity: An Essay in Ecclesial Biblical Theology." Scottish Journal of Theology 56.1 (2003): 1–26.
- Sanders, Fred. "Entangled in the Trinity: Economic and Immanent Trinity in Recent Theology." *Dialog: A Journal of Theology* 40.3 (2001): 175–182.
- Schwobel, Christopher, ed. *Trinitarian Theology Today: Essays on Divine Acts and Being*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark,
 1995.
- Soulen, R. Kendall. "Yahweh the Triune God." *Modern Theology* 15.1 (1999): 25– 54.
- Swinburne, Richard. *The Christian God*. Oxford: Clarendon, 2004.
- Tertullian, Adversus Praxean.
- Torrance, Thomas F. The Christian

 Doctrine of God, One Being Three

 Persons. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1996.
- ——. The Trinitarian Faith: The Evangelical Theology of the Ancient Catholic Church. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1988.
- ——. Trinitarian Perspectives: Toward Doctrinal Agreement. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1999.
- Turcescu, Lucian. *Gregory of Nyssa and the Concept of Divine Persons*. AAR
 Academy Series. New York: Oxford

- University Press, 2005.
- Twomey, D. Vincent, and Lewis Ayres, eds. The Mystery of the Holy Trinity in the Fathers of the Church: The Proceedings of the Fourth Patristic Conference, Maynooth, 1999. Dublin: Four Courts, 2007.
- Volf, Miroslav, and Michael Walker, eds. *God's Life in Trinity*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2006.
- Wainwright, Arthur W. *The Trinity in the New Testament*. London: SPCK, 1969.
- Ware, Bruce A. "Equal in Essence, Distinct in Roles: Eternal Functional Authority and Submission Among the Essentially Equal Divine Persons of the Godhead." Journal for Biblical Manhood and Womanhood 13.2 (2008): 43–58.
- Watson, Francis. "The Triune Divine Identity: Reflections on Pauline God-Language, in Disagreement with J. D. G. Dunn." *Journal for the Study of the New Testament* 80 (2000): 99–124.
- Webster, John. "The Identity of the Holy Spirit: A Problem in Trinitarian Theology." *Themelios* 9.1 (1983): 4–7.
- Wierenga, Edward. "Trinity and Polytheism." *Faith and Philosophy* 21.3 (2004): 281–94.
- Wright, Christopher J. H. *Knowing God the Father Through the Old Testament*.

 Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity, 2007.
- ——. Knowing the Holy Spirit Through the Old Testament. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity, 2006.

——. Knowing Jesus Through the Old Testament. Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity, 1992.
Zizioulas, John D. Being as Communion: Studies in Personhood and the Church. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's

Seminary Press, 1985.

CHARLES MEEKS